

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Translational Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 21498

Title: Role of nestin in glioma invasion

Reviewer's code: 02842184

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-29 16:00

Date reviewed: 2015-07-29 20:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The relationship of nestin and glioma was well discussed in the paper. It's ok to publish here I think.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Translational Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 21498

Title: Role of nestin in glioma invasion

Reviewer's code: 00473387

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-29 16:00

Date reviewed: 2015-07-31 08:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this paper, Lin and colleagues studied the role of the stem cell marker nestin in the proliferation and migration/invasiveness of two glioma cell lines. The results were largely negative, suggesting that nestin expression has no effect on proliferation and invasiveness, with the possible exception of decreased invasiveness seen in one of the cell lines after nestin knockdown. But the significance of this decreased invasiveness in cell culture is difficult to interpret in light of the fact the nestin knockdown in the same cells had no effect on in vivo migration in a mouse xenograft model. In addition, several previous studies (not cited by the authors) have shown that nestin expression in human glioblastomas has no correlation with survival. A correlation with prognosis is only seen when lower grade gliomas are analyzed together with glioblastomas. However, a correlation between nestin expression and prognosis has been previously reported in lower grade gliomas (again not cited by the authors), which are difficult to study using cell culture models. Based on this study, it is reasonable to conclude that nestin is not among the most promising targets for therapy in glioblastomas. Overall, this is an outstanding, solid study from the methodological standpoint. The authors have done all the right experiments to address their question. They even provide evidence



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

suggesting a possible reason why nestin is not required for migration in some cell lines; they show that the cells may compensate by increasing the expression of synemin.