

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Translational Medicine

ESPS manuscript NO: 22876

Title: Gene editing technology for corneal disease management

Reviewer's code: 03408377

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2015-10-02 15:22

Date reviewed: 2015-10-29 00:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript Raikwar et al gave a clear introduction about gene editing nucleases and its applications. The manuscript is well written and will cover wide audience in the area of corneal diseases. However, I have one suggestion to authors. They should write little more about genes could be targeted for genome editing with respect to corneal diseases and its implications. The authors failed to include some of the original articles on Zinc finger nucleases Example: Kim and Chandrasegaran 1994 PNAS Kim et al 1996 PNAS These articles must be included in the manuscript. The authors should give enough credit to the original inventors. The first truly targetable reagents were the Zinc finger nucleases (Kim et al 1996) that showed that arbitrary DNA sequence could be addressed for cleavage by protein engineering ushering in the breakthrough in genome manipulation. Although most genome engineering scientists switched their strategies to use newer tools like CRISPR/Cas9, nearly all of this more recent work is based on fundamental experiments by pioneering ZFN scientist.