



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Methodology

ESPS manuscript NO: 7604

Title: Measurement of body composition as a surrogate evaluation of energy balance in obese patients

Reviewer's code: 00506232

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2013-11-26 22:17

Date reviewed: 2013-12-29 05:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Aim of the manuscript was to revise the role of body composition and energy expenditure assessment in the evaluation of overweight and obesity It is an article of outstanding merit and interest in its field



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Methodology

ESPS manuscript NO: 7604

Title: Measurement of body composition as a surrogate evaluation of energy balance in obese patients

Reviewer’s code: 02446317

Reviewer’s country: United States

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2013-11-26 22:17

Date reviewed: 2013-12-03 03:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review manuscript by Rotella and Dicembrini, entitled “Measurement of body composition as a surrogate evaluation of energy balance in obese patients” offers informative insight into the benefits and disadvantages of different methods in measuring body composition. The authors focus on the role of various methods in assessing energy expenditures in obese individuals.

The manuscript is informative, and should be considered for publication after the following issues will have been addressed, or adequate rebuttal offered.

- 1) The quality of this manuscript would be greatly enhanced should the authors would add information about how adequate these methods are in overweight or obese children, since obesity rates have increased in children. How well BIA would work in obese children?
- 2) The Conclusions section should be re-structured: with the exception of the last paragraph, the others are providing new information, so these should be integrated within the manuscript before the Conclusions section. The Conclusions should be shorter: only the last paragraph contains true conclusions.
- 3) When BIA method is first mentioned, it should be spelled out. There is no indication throughout the manuscript for what BIA stands for.
- 4) The phrase “The principles and clinical utilization of BIA have been largely described in two ESPEN position papers.” should contain the references to the two papers discussed.

Minor errors regarding the English language are pervasive throughout the manuscript and should be corrected. The syntax, topic, and the use of terms should be revisited. Several examples are:

“Despite the unquestionable association between BMI-defined obesity and mortality, multiple studies have shown a U or J-shaped evaluating the relationship between BMI, all causes and/or cardiovascular mortality have generally shown a U or J-shape curve, identifying the best survival rate for BMI values in the overweight range (25–27 kg/m²) followed by a dramatic increase in risk profile at higher or lower levels (4-9).” This phrase is too long and unclear.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

“Further studies have challenged the louder association...”. The English “louder” is the comparative adjective for “loud”, which is a characteristic of sound. Please re-phrase.

“Despite more recent in vitro evidences against the possible translation of the beneficial effects observed in mice to humans, the major role of muscle mass in the energy balance has been definitively established.” This phrase makes no sense. “Despite” defines opposition between two parts. In this phrase however, both sentences have positive meanings. Please re-phrase.

Other similar issues exist in other places within the manuscript.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Methodology

ESPS manuscript NO: 7604

Title: Measurement of body composition as a surrogate evaluation of energy balance in obese patients

Reviewer's code: 00158289

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen

Date sent for review: 2013-11-26 22:17

Date reviewed: 2014-01-08 07:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present paper is a very interesting work aimed to describe methods analyzing FFM and FM, pointing out the limits of BMI. The paper is well writtend and organized. However it should be included a comment on childhood age for vthe different methodology and a comment on the use of body shape index.