BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Methodology
ESPS manuscript NO: 20708
Title: Mild oxidative stress is beneficial for sperm telomere length maintenance
Reviewer's code: 02445880
Reviewer's country: Poland
Science editor: Yue-Li Tian
Date sent for review: 2015-06-18 08:24
Date reviewed: 2015-07-24 23:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I my opinion this is quite well designed study which is worth to be published in scientific journal. Language is communicative, manuscript is concise, methods are well chosen, results transparent and discussion sufficient. My final decision is accept for publication.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Methodology
ESPS manuscript NO: 20708
Title: Mild oxidative stress is beneficial for sperm telomere length maintenance
Reviewer's code: 02508219
Reviewer's country: Egypt
Science editor: Yue-Li Tian
Date sent for review: 2015-06-18 08:24
Date reviewed: 2015-09-02 21:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[Y] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present study had an objective of measuring the telomere length in sperm DNA and its correlation with oxidative stress level (ROS and 8 Isoprostane). The authors came up with interesting findings where they showed negative correlation between telomere length and oxidative stress level. Moreover, they showed a possible beneficial effect of moderate oxidative stress on telomere length in semen samples of infertile men. The following are some critiques/suggestions regarding the present work: 1- The manuscript needs thorough revision where there is much crossing and intermingling of information between the different sections (introduction, results and discussion), besides a few grammar and editing mistakes. 2- The citations are put in many paragraphs in a collective manner where the reader does not know which information fragment belongs to which reference. 3- The authors claimed increased telomere length to moderate oxidative stress level in the relevant infertile men subgroups while the mean oxidative stress level in the control group was much less than that moderate oxidative range. Therefore, the authors may correlate telomere length to oxidative stress in the control cases too and they may show that a considerable number of controls had oxidative stress levels in the moderate range.