

Reviewer #1

This is an interesting case of a patient with rheumatic heart disease who benefited from TCM. However it is not well written up, several very important points are missed, or incorrect statements made, all of which need revision.

1. The prodrome of RHD is acute rheumatic fever - 'predisposing cause' should be used instead of prodrome

Reply to 1: We have changed it as 'predisposing cause' as you recommended.

2. The results of the imaging examinations given in Tables 1 and 2 are not useful in assessing patients with rheumatic valve disease. For mitral stenosis: valve area and diastolic pressure half-time are important; for mitral and aortic regurgitation: regurgitant volume, regurgitant fraction and effective regurgitant orifice area together with ejection fraction and end systolic diameter are important. If these are unavailable, authors should not present irrelevant data like in Table 1 and 2.

3. Compared with the previous results of the color ultrasound, the patient showed improvement in aortic regurgitation from moderate to mild - this statement is incorrect in the absence of relevant data (as indicated in point 2). or the color doppler images for aortic regurgitation

Reply to 2&3: We have revised the tables and made it in one table which can be compared with the data before and after the treatment. Aortic regurgitation area and Left ventricular ejection fraction (LEVF) have been improved after the treatment, these two data means the regurgitation of aortic was improved and the ejection function of the heart was also improved.

4. The patient has had frequent ventricular tachycardia with a heart rate of >200 - this statement is not supported by any ECG nor are any blood results given as to possible precipitating causes for ventricular tachycardia like, hypokalemia, infection or myocarditis. This is very important since the effect of TCM is likely to be on the abnormalities in the blood which lead to arrhythmia that then further compromised heart function and resulted in patient symptoms. TCM is unlikely to change the anatomy of the heart valves but likely effected dynamic functional change in the heart as in its rhythm or in blood parameters affecting it.

Reply to 4: It should be supraventricular tachycardia heart rate, we revised it, we agree that TCM can really alleviate the symptoms and help to improve the abnormalities of the blood. So, the improvements in the patients may work as what you said.

Reviewer #2

The case reported of RHD disease treated with traditional Chinese medicine was very good and appealing to me. I have a few suggestions to be incorporated before acceptance. 1. As this is one case report so use, "A case report...." In title 2. At lines 63 and 83, used world year instead of yr.

Reply to 1&2: The title and the 'year' we changed as you recommended.

3. Author(s) should suggest the reason for using a specific quantity of each root in the composition of the traditional medication recommended. 4. The exact same dose of these medications was given from the start, or has it been changed by considering the condition of the patient over time?

Reply to 3&4: the specific dose of the herb we added in the revised article. The main formula we did not change through the treatment. We adjust 2 or 3 herbs considering the condition of the patient.

5. The test reports presented in Tables 1 and 2 are almost the same and did not show any potential change. The author(s) should consider it by showing graphically or tabularly the values or report(s), so it can be better to under by a reader.

Reply to 5: Thank you for your suggestions, we show the differences before and after the treatment with graphically values.