

ANSWERING REVIEWERS

Name of journal: **World Journal of Meta-Analysis**

Manuscript Number: **79510**

Type: Systematic Review

Title: **POST-COVID-19 CHOLANGIOPATHY: A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW**

Authors: Maddalena Zippi, Sirio Fiorino, Wandong Hong, Dario de Biase, Claudio Giuseppe Gallo, Alfonso Grottesi, Annamaria Centorame and Pietro Crispino

Dear Editors and Reviewers,

Thank You for your precious time spent in reviewing the work and for allowing us to submit a revised version of our manuscript. We would also like to thank the reviewers for their pertinent and helpful comments. We have considered each of these in depth and have incorporated the appropriate changes in the revised version of the manuscript. We are confident that this revised manuscript will address the reviewers' concerns.

All changes we have made to address these comments are described below. In the revised manuscript, all changes in the text are highlighted in red.

Reviewer #1:

Scientific Quality: Grade B (Very good)

Language Quality: Grade B (Minor language polishing)

Conclusion: Major revision

First, we would like to thank the Reviewer for his constructive comments. Really, we appreciate your review of our work.

1. Change the title of the article to better reflect the study's purpose.

We thank You for the suggestion to change the title of the work, but we believe that it fully reflects the subject matter and the type of review, therefore we have not changed it.

2. Paraphrasing the study abstract and explaining all abbreviations mentioned in the study abstract or otherwise in the article.

In accordance with the guidelines concerning the drafting of systematic reviews, the abstract it has not been paraphrased. However, we appreciated his suggestion and paraphrased it. Lacking abbreviations have been inserted as suggested.

3. Adherence to emphasizing the research problem in the final paragraph of the study's introduction, with an explanation of how to address the research problem within the framework of the study's objective.

We have changed the final part of this section in: "In order to pursue the objective of this research, we have performed an extensive bibliographic search of the published works available in the literature concerning post-COVID-19 cholangiopathy. Then we have conducted a systematic review of this topic."

4. The study's introduction is lengthy. Please keep the main information as brief as possible and avoid the side headings.

The introduction has been "streamlined" in accordance with your suggestion.

5. Some references explaining the protocol used can be added to the materials and methods section.

We have inserted in the text: "The authors have used the PRISMA 2009 Checklist and the manuscript has been prepared and revised according to it" [Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG; PRISMA Group. Preferred reporting items for systematic reviews and meta-analyses: the PRISMA statement. PLoS Med.

6. Working on expanding the materials and methods section further by clarifying the statistical method used and how to select research samples.

In regard the statistical analysis, the heterogeneity in data, as well their small size, limited the possibility to perform comparative statistical analysis or a meta-analysis. Only a descriptive analysis with percentages was carried out, not using any specific software. The research method and the selection of the articles considered in this review is explained in detail in the materials and methods section.

7. The study's title specifies that it is a systematic review. I believe the manner in which the data was processed in the results section is incompatible with the nature of the study. This flaw should be fixed.

We have checked other papers published in this series of Journals (BPG), many systematic reviews have been elaborated in the same way as we did (an example: Rossi RE, Elvevi A, Gallo C, Palermo A, Invernizzi P, Massironi S. Endoscopic techniques for diagnosis and treatment of gastro-entero-pancreatic neuroendocrine neoplasms: Where we are. *World J Gastroenterol* 2022; 28(26): 3258-3273).

8. Avoiding side headings in the discussion section and devoting the final paragraph of the discussion to highlighting the study's limitations, strengths, and future directions.

The side headings in the discussion section has been deleted. We believe that post-covid cholangiopathy is a topic of interest that may have future developments. Unfortunately the low number of studies available at the moment and the small number of enrolled patients constitute a current limit to our evaluation. we hope that in the future there will be studies focused on this new emerging pathology including a greater number of subjects, in order to be able to better interpret which is the best treatment to offer.

9. The discussion section is very brief and does not meet the requirements of the discussion criteria; try to address this weakness.

The discussion has been implemented.

10. Rewrite the conclusion to demonstrate whether or not the study's objective was met.

This research is quite innovative and therefore is limited by several factors that have been outlined above, therefore more studies with a larger number of enrolled patients are needed.

11. References must be written in accordance with the journal's policies, with a commitment to be recent references dating back to 2015 or more. Good Luck,

The bibliographic references were written in accordance with the journal's policies, in particular, in the original version out of 51 references only 2 were prior to 2015, all the remaining were from 2020 onwards except one of 2015. In the new version (revision), new 2020-2022 references have been added.

Reviewer #2:

Scientific Quality: Grade D (Fair)

Language Quality: Grade C (A great deal of language polishing)

Conclusion: Major revision

Thank you very much for sending and submitting your article. This manuscript is not well organized and unfortunately the principles that should be observed in systematic review articles do not exist. Most of the discussion and introduction parts are written based on unrelated articles, therefore the acceptable result that should be derived from this article will not be obtained.

We regret that we disagree with this Reviewer, regarding the "summary" comments of the work. Not a single constructive one was provided to improve the work. The Reviewer can find the answers he was looking for in our comments to the other Reviewer.

Science editor:

The manuscript has been peer-reviewed, and it's ready for the first decision.

Language Quality: Grade C (A great deal of language polishing)

Scientific Quality: Grade C (Good)

In regard to the quality of the English language, as we are not native speakers, we sent the work to an editing system (You can check the attached certificate).

In addition, the paper was revised further by Dr Saveria de Vito (Italian Medicines Agency, Rome, Italy) for grammatical and spell errors. Although she is not native English speaker, is highly qualified for work reasons as evidenced by the following works in which she performed the revisions: 1) M. Zippi et al. "Extraintestinal manifestations in a large series of Italian inflammatory bowel disease patients" *World Journal of Gastroenterology* 2014 December 14; 20(46): 17463-17467; 2) S Fiorino, M Zippi, C Benini, AL De Quarto, M Masetti, M F Lerro, A Lazzari, R Lombardi, M Zanello, L Mastrangelo, S Aldrovandi, G De Sario, M Chisari, L Dova, N Simone, G Ciabatti, G Acquaviva, M Visani, A Fornelli, A Tura, PE Orlandi, G Occhigrossi, P Leandri, F Ballarini, S Bortolussi, A Pession, L Rasciti, E Giampieri, I Corazza, ML Bacchi-Reggiani, D de Biase, E Jovine. Prevalence of Antigens/ Antibodies Against Hepatitis B and C Viruses in A Cohort of Italian Patients with Pancreatic Adenocarcinoma Admitted to Two Hospital Wards in Italy: A Pivotal Retrospective Study. *Archives of Microbiology & Immunology* 2019; 3 (3): 107-132; 3) Zippi M, Pica R, Febbraro I, Pugliese FR, Liguori F. Splenic Hematoma as a Rare Complication of Colonoscopy; a Case Report. *Arch Acad Emerg Med*. 2020 Oct 25;8(1):e84. PMID: 33244519; PMCID: PMC7682628 ; 4) Zippi M, Hong W, Traversa G, Maccioni F, De Biase D, Gallo C, Fiorino S. Involvement of the exocrine pancreas during COVID-19 infection and possible pathogenetic hypothesis: a concise review. *Infez Med*. 2020 Dec 1;28(4):507-515. PMID: 33257624.; 5) Zippi M, Fiorino S, Budriesi R, Micucci M, Corazza I, Pica R, de Biase D, Gallo CG, Hong W. Paradoxical relationship between proton pump inhibitors and COVID-19: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *World J Clin Cases*. 2021 Apr 26;9(12):2763-2777. doi: 10.12998/wjcc.v9.i12.2763. PMID: 33969059; PMCID: PMC8058681.; 6) Fiorino S, Tateo F, Biase D, Gallo CG, Orlandi PE, Corazza I, Budriesi R, Micucci M, Visani M, Loggi E, Hong W, Pica R, Lari F, Zippi M. SARS-CoV-2: lessons from both the history of medicine and from the biological behavior of other well-known viruses. *Future Microbiol*. 2021 Sep;16(14):1105-1133. doi: 10.2217/fmb-2021-0064. Epub 2021 Sep 1. PMID: 34468163; PMCID: PMC8412036.; 7) Grottesi A, Iacovitti S, Ciano P, Borrini F, Zippi M. Simultaneous laparoscopic removal of a Todani type II choledochal cyst and a microlithiasic cholecystitis. *Ann Hepatobiliary Pancreat Surg*. 2022 Aug 31;26(3):281-284. doi: 10.14701/ahbps.22-011. Epub 2022 Jun 7. PMID: 35672029; PMCID: PMC9428432.

Company editor-in-chief:

Authors are advised to apply a new tool, the Reference Citation Analysis (RCA) which can then be used to further improve an article under preparation/peer-review/revision.

Thanks for the valuable suggestion. We found only one narrative review on this topic still Epub ahead of print (Caballero-Alvarado J, Corvera CZ, Bacilio BM, Caballero CR, Lozano-Peralta K. POST COVID CHOLANGIOPATHY: A NARRATIVE REVIEW. *Gastroenterol Hepatol*. 2022 Sep 26:S0210-5705(22)00221-7. English, Spanish. doi: 10.1016/j.gastrohep.2022.09.004. Epub ahead of print. PMID: 36174796; PMCID: PMC9512521.).

We thank You again for reviewing the article, your suggestions were very much appreciated.

Kind regards,

Maddalena Zippi, Sirio Fiorino, Wandong Hong, Dario de Biase, Claudio Giuseppe Gallo, Alfonso Grottesi, Annamaria Centorame and Pietro Crispino