

Manuscript type: Frontier

Manuscript number: 28726

Manuscript title: "To VAD or not to VAD: When is implantation of a ventricular assist device appropriate in advanced ambulatory heart failure?"

Response to Reviewers:

*Reviewed by 02794723*

The manuscript "to VAD or not to VAD" describes as a review the actually status of LVAD therapy in heart failure. It gives a well written and comprehensive overview. The only criticism is the length of the article with need some shortening regarding right ventricle failure. Secondly the paragraph "quality of life" deals only in one sentence with this aspect. Here QoL aspects are needed.

**Thank you for the comments and your time in reviewing of this manuscript. Although we agree that the length spent on right ventricular failure is rather lengthy, it is perhaps the most controversial topic at the moment in left ventricular assist device (LVAD) therapy. Of all the literature in the past 5 years, the most cited paper is the one on predicting right ventricular failure following LVAD therapy by Kormos et al. and as such a particularly interesting concept when discussing the timing of LVAD implantation. As such, we have elected to keep the length of discussion on this topic of right ventricular failure. We certainly value your thoughts and criticism.**

**The second paragraph / section on quality of life is difficult to expand on as no definitive data exists on LVAD therapy. It is most often a subjective quality measure that is defined by the 6 minute walk test and the New York Heart Association classification which are both discussed in the second paragraph of this section and as such we have elected to keep it as is. Once again, we value your input and perhaps this can be a study that we look at in the future to be able to better quantify quality of life.**

*Reviewed by 02445850*

No comment.

**Thank you for your time in reviewing our paper.**

*Reviewed by 02633299*

Cerier E et al present a paper about usefulness for earlier implantation of LVADs through increased survival and quality of life, avoidance of multi-organ deterioration and chronic low cardiac output in patients with terminal therapie refracter Heartfailure. This article is very gut written and interesting for the reader. Therefore , it should be published.

**Thank you for your time in reviewing our paper.**

*Reviewed by 02638028*

It is a good and well-written review about the LVAD implantation

**Thank you for your time in reviewing our paper.**

*Reviewed by 02633655*

Very well written.

**Thank you for your time in reviewing our paper.**