

ANSWERING REVIEWERS



May 15, 2014

Dear Editor,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in Word format (file name: 10780-review.doc).

Title: *Single-site laparoscopic partial nephrectomy: where are we going?*

Author: R. Castellucci, L. Cindolo, M. Alvaréz-Maestro, G. Giusti, F. Berardinelli, F. Pellegrini, L. Schips.

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Urology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10780

The manuscript has been improved according to the suggestions of reviewers:

1 Format has been updated

2 Revision has been made according to the suggestions of the reviewer

- 1) The article is well-written. The main comments are: Material and methods. Would you be so kind to clarify the reason for choosing only the single-centre studies. It may be interesting to mention the inclusion criteria for considering patients for LESS-PN

-In the literature, there are two recent multicenter studies:

A) Laparoendoscopic single-site surgery in urology:worldwide multi-institutional analysis of 1076 cases. Kaouk JH, Autorino R, Kim FJ, Han DH, Lee SW, Yinghao S, Cadeddu JA, Derweesh IH, Richstone L, Cindolo L, Branco A, Greco E, Allaf M, Sotelo R, Liatsikos E, Stolzenburg JU, Rane A, White WM, Han WK, Haber GP, White MA, Molina WR, Jeong BC, Lee JY, Linhui W, Best S, Stroup SP, Rais-Bahrami S, Schips L, Fornara P, Pierorazio P, Giedelman C, Lee JW, Stein RJ, Rha KH. Eur Urol. 2011 Nov;60(5):998-1005. doi: 10.1016/j.eururo.2011.06.002. Epub 2011 Jun 12.

B) Laparoendoscopic single-site partial nephrectomy: a multi-institutional outcome analysis. Greco F1, Autorino R, Rha KH, Derweesh I, Cindolo L, Richstone L, Herrmann TR, Liatsikos E, Sun Y, Fanizza C, Nagele U, Stolzenburg JU, Rais-Bahrami S, Liss MA, Schips L, Kassab A, Wang L, Kallidonis P, Wu Z, Young ST, Mohammed N, Haber GP, Springer C, Fornara P, Kaouk JH. Eur Urol. 2013 Aug;64(2):314-22. doi: 10.1016/j.eururo.2013.01.025. Epub 2013 Feb 8.

We decided to exclude from our review between these two works because their patients are in common with each other and with those we included. In addition, most of the authors of the articles we included in the review are co-authors of the two multi-center work. For now, the LESS is not widely discussed in the scientific literature as it is a procedure recently

- Inclusion criteria for considering patients for LESS-PN were included

(2) This is a minireview on a very important and actual issue. The review is complete, well written and worth to be published. Only a minor english revision needed. The only minor comment is the lacking in the references of PMID and DOI as the journal policy requires. I recommend that also this aspect should be

reviewed by the authors

-PMDI were included in references

(3) This is a reasonably well written review of LESS partial nephrectomy. It modestly adds to the literature. A few comments: 1. It seems to me rather arbitrary to exclude all multi-institutional studies- and also counter-intuitive. A logic should be provided for this. An update of the cited Kaouk multiinstitutional study is available and should be cited instead 4. It is a bit biased towards LESS. This should be softened. ... A pet peeve of mine- though a common mistake, a "steep" learning curve is easy, a "shallow" or "long" learning curve is difficult. Perhaps the authors should use "difficult" or "prolonged" instead of steep.

-Kaouk multiinstitutional study was already mentioned , reference n 9

- We decided to exclude from our review between these two works because their patients are in common with each other and with those we included. In addition, most of the authors of the articles we included in the review are co-authors of the two multi-center work. For now, the LESS is not widely discussed in the scientific literature as it is a procedure recently. (previously described)

-learnig curve was corrected by "prolonged"

3 References and typesetting were corrected

Thank you again for publishing our manuscript in the *World Journal of Clinical Urology*

Sincerely yours,



Corresponding author:

Dott. Roberto Castellucci, MD

Università degli Studi "G. D'Annunzio" Chieti (Italy)

Hospital Infanta Sofia Madrid (Spain)

Via Ofanto, 16 - Pescara

tel: +39 329-5449222; +34 722565337

email: roberto.castellucci@gmail.com