

ANSWERING REVIEWERS



Dear Editor,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in word format (file name: 20927-Review.doc).

Title: Immunomodulation with rabbit anti-thymocyte globulin in solid organ transplantation

Author: Giovanbattista Ippoliti, Marco Lucioni, Giuseppe Leonardi, Marco Paulli

Name of Journal: *World Journal of Transplantation*

ESPS Manuscript NO: 20927

The manuscript has been improved according to the suggestions of reviewers:

1 Format has been updated.

2 Revision has been made according to the suggestions of the reviewer:

Reviewer 1

Reviewed by 00070310

This paper reviewed immunomodulation with rabbit anti-thymocyte globulin in solid organ transplantation. This is interesting and almost parts are well written. However, it will require some changes before it can be accepted for publication. Please show how the authors have selected literatures of rabbit anti-thymocyte globulin.

The selection of literature is now highlighted in the references.

Reviewer 2

Reviewed by 00504335

This is well prepared review on general properties of RATG. The review is written by researchers having experience with immunosuppression and publishing in this field. I have only two comments: 1. On p. 3 the authors claim that Tab. 1 shows "The spectrum of antibodies contained in RATG". However, Table 1 is entitled "Summary of known target antigens recognized..." This should be in the same way. 2. On p. 9 the authors write that RATG expands Tregs (from the ref. 32). In the next paragraph (page 10) the authors discuss another study (ref. 33) which shows that RATG rather eliminates Tregs (without expansion of Tregs). The authors should express more exact conclusion on the effect of RATG on Tregs. 3. Numerous misprinting should be corrected

1. The title of Table 1 has been changed, as required.
2. Pag.9:
 - a. There are differences between the two papers: # 32 (X Feng et al), is an in vitro RATG testing on cells isolated from healthy volunteers and, therefore, not immunosuppressed. # 33 (Sewgobind VD et al) evaluate the 'effect of RATG, administered in vivo, on + Tregs in patients with kidney transplant and in triple therapy regimen (Tac, MMF and Pred). The control group is on triple therapy without RATG. We think that the two studies are not comparable. In the text is specified the section that refers to studies in vitro or in vivo.

- b. The observation of the reviewer should be considered. The reading of the text leads to an inaccurate assessment of the action of RATG on Tregs. We propose the following text integration.
- c. After administration of RATG, no measurable Tregs Fop3+ cells were detectable after one week, because of low number of CD4+ T cells within the T-cell population. After 26 weeks, the regulatory capacity of Tregs Foxp3+ remained unaffected. They fully preserved their suppressive activity and were able to effectively govern allogeneic immune responses by effector T cells as before RATG treatment.
- d. Misprintings have been corrected.

3 References and typesetting were corrected.

Thank you again for publishing our manuscript in the *World Journal of Transplantation*.