

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 36929

Title: Hepatocyte Transplantation: Consider Infusion Before Incision

Reviewer's code: 00054465

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-10-29

Date reviewed: 2017-10-29

Review time: 8 Hours

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A very interesting and comprehensive review of hepatocyte transplantation so far. A comment on the success of islet cell transplants would be useful and how this might apply to hepatocytes. Is it just a volume of cells difference or is the autoislets cell transplantation the real secret to success, where immunosuppression is not an issue. A comment too on the potential role of genetic editing in the future would be useful

We appreciate the reviewer's acceptance. We attempted to add to the discussion on preparation of hepatocytes to reflect these questions.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 36929

Title: Hepatocyte Transplantation: Consider Infusion Before Incision

Reviewer's code: 00504150

Reviewer's country: Canada

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-10-29

Date reviewed: 2017-10-30

Review time: 1 Day

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the manuscript entitled, "Hepatocyte transplantation: Consider infusion before incision", Heath and co-workers summarize the current status of hepatocyte transplantation. One important aspect lacking in this review is how to prepare hepatocyte. Are there any advancements in hepatocyte isolation technology? Are there any changes in regulatory issues regarding manufacturing process? The authors may want to consider including these aspects in the manuscript. There are a few minor points that the authors should address. 1. There are so many errors in terms of usage of capital letter. For example, there is no need of capital "V" for vitamin D. 2. There are many unnecessary abbreviations.

1. We reviewed and made the requested changes.

2. On review, we agree that the table using these abbreviations is confusing and have removed the abbreviations.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Transplantation

Manuscript NO: 36929

Title: Hepatocyte Transplantation: Consider Infusion Before Incision

Reviewer's code: 00505314

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-10-29

Date reviewed: 2017-11-08

Review time: 10 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors discuss hepatocyte transplantation predominantly for in born errors of metabolism. In most instances it acted as a bridge to liver transplantation. The main difficulty observed is the challenge of maintaining hepatocyte function long term. The article is written well. I have the following comments/critiques: 1. There should be some discussion or recommendation regarding type of immunosuppression needed in these patients. 2. Is there any data on hepatocyte transplantation in conditions such as primary hyperoxaluria?

1. We agree that this point should be clarified and have added onto the section "Monitoring Graft Function" noting that tacrolimus appears to be appropriate immunosuppression, however, that further prospective cohort studies evaluating appropriate monitoring intervals are likely necessary to ensure

optimized and sustained function.

2. We cannot find any data on humans regarding primary hyperoxaluria, though there are studies on mice. It appears there is ongoing clinical trial at Albert Einstein, however, no results are available at this time.