

## ESPS JOURNAL EDITOR-IN-CHIEF'S REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 21222

**Title:** Combining cytochrome CYP3A4 modulators and cyclosporine or everolimus in transplantation is successful

**Journal Editor-in-Chief (Associate Editor):** Maurizio Salvadori

**Country:** Italy

**Editorial Director:** Xiu-Xia Song

**Date sent for review:** 2015-09-06 19:55

**Date reviewed:** 2015-09-08 03:06

ACADEMIC CONTENT EVALUATION	LANGUAGE QUALITY EVALUATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		

### JOURNAL EDITOR-IN-CHIEF (ASSOCIATE EDITOR) COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

As editor in chief I have several concerns in accepting this manuscript for publication. In my opinion the authors did not reply the reviewers in the right way. The manuscript does not refer to a prospective study, but rather to an observational one. Several points are missing: a) the predetermined number of enrolled patients and the two groups are too much size different; b) I do not see the Ethical committee statement: I should see the number and the date c) Nothing has been said on the potential ketokonazole toxicity. This is a relevant point as the drug is administered for a long time. d) A cyclosporine pharmacokinetics study should have been done e) Nothing is said about drops out from the study and the side effects of immunosuppression f) The AZA/MMF group is going to loose given the high number of DGF. This factor infers on all the results. Give please the results of the clean population (not DGF) g) Going up with Everolimus dose is possible to reduce CsA administration (please look at paper: Everolimus With Very Low-Exposure Cyclosporine A in De Novo Kidney Transplantation: A Multicenter, Randomized, Controlled Trial, published on Transplantation h) A warning should be stated on the use of CYP3A4 modulator, as with the new immunosuppressants we do not need of them